Owensby, et al.vs. City of Cincinnati November 6, 2003 DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER, JR.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO

WESTERN DIVISION

ESTATE OF ROGER D.

OWENSBY JR., et al.,

Plaintiffs, : Case No. 01-CV-769

vs. : (Judge S. A. Spiegel)

CITY OF CINCINNATI, : VOLUME I

et al.,

:

Defendants: :

Videotaped deposition of DAVID WILLIAM

HUNTER JR., a witness herein, called by the

plaintiffs for cross-examination, pursuant to the

Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, taken before me,

Wendy Davies Welsh, a Registered Diplomate Reporter

and Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, at

the offices of Helmer, Martins & Morgan Co. LPA,

1900 Fourth & Walnut Centre, 105 East Fourth Street,

Cincinnati, Ohio, on Thursday, November 6, 2003, at

2:43 p.m.

(800) 578-1542 * MERIT * (513) 381-8228

1

Owensby, ct al.vs. City of Cincinnati November 6, 2003

DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER, JR.

```
Page 4
                                                                                  Page 2
                                                                                            1 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, may be taken at
1
   APPEARANCES:
                                                                                               this time by the notary; that said deposition may be
2
          On behalf of the Plaintiffs:
                Paul B. Martins, Esq.
Don Stiens, Esq.
Frederick H. Morgan Jr., Esq.
Helmer, Martins & Morgan Co. LPA
                                                                                            3 reduced to writing in stenotype by the notary, whose
                                                                                                notes may then be transcribed out of the presence of
                Suite 1900, Fourth & Walnut Centre
                                                                                               the witness; and that proof of the official
                105 East Fourth Street
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
Phone: (513) 421-2400
                                                                                                character and qualifications of the notary is
6
                                                                                                expressly waived.
                John J. Helbling, Esq.
The Helbling Law Firm, L.L.C.
3672 Springdale Road
Cincinnati, Ohio 45251
Phone: (513) 923-9740
                                                                                            8
8
                                                                                            9
          On behalf of the Defendants City of Golf Manor,
Stephen Tilley, Roby Heiland and Chris
Campbell:
                                                                                           10
                                                                                                                          INDEX
10
                                                                                                                                             Page
11
                                                                                           12
                                                                                                            Mr. Martins . . . . . .
12
                Wilson G. Weisenfelder Jr., Esq..
Rendigs, Fry, Kiely & Dennis
900 Fourth & Vine Tower
                                                                                            13
                                                                                                                           - - -
13
                One West Fourth Street
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-3688
14
                 Phone: (513) 381-9200
                                                                                           15
15
                                                                                                                       EXHIBITS
          On behalf of the Defendants City of Cincinnati, Darren Sellers, Jason Hodge:
                                                                                            16
16
                                                                                            17
17
                Geri Hernandez Geiler, Esq.
Assistant City Solicitor
                                                                                               Deposition Exhibit 6A
Deposition Exhibit 54
Deposition Exhibit 55
Deposition Exhibit 56
Deposition Exhibit 57
Deposition Exhibit 58
                                                                                            18
18
                Assistant City Solicitor and Julie F. Bissinger, Esq. Chief Counsel Department of Law Room 214, City Hall 801 Plum Street Cincinnati, Ohio 45202 Phone: (513) 352-3346
                                                                                            19
19
                                                                                           20
20
                                                                                            21
21
                                                                                            22
22
                                                                                            23
23
24
                                                                                                                                                                             Page 5
 1 APPEARANCES (Continued):
                                                                                                          VIDEOGRAPHER: Time is 2:43 p.m. The date
                                                                                              1
           Patrick Caton, Jason Hodge, Victor Spellen and Darren Sellers:
                                                                                             2
                                                                                                     is November the 6th. The year is 2003.
 3
                                                                                                          If you'd please swear the witness, ma'am.
                                                                                             3
                 Donald E. Hardin, Esq.
                                                                                                             DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER JR.
                 Hardin, Lefton, Lazarus & Marks, LLC
915 Cincinnati Club Building
30 Garfield Place
                                                                                             5 being by me first duly cautioned and sworn, deposes
                 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
Phone: (513) 721-7300
 6
                                                                                                 and says as follows:
                                                                                                          VIDEOGRAPHER: We're on the record, Mr.
                                                                                             7
           On behalf of the David William Hunter Jr.:
                                                                                                     Martins. This is videotape number 1, sir.
                Jay Clark, Esq.
114 East 8th Street
Suite 400
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
Phone (513) 587-2887
                                                                                             8
                                                                                                                CROSS-EXAMINATION
                                                                                             9
10
                                                                                            10 BY MR. MARTINS:
                                                                                                      Q. Sir, would you state for the record your
                                                                                             12 full name, please.
     Richard W. Grubb, Videographer
13
                                                                                                      A. David William Hunter Jr.
     Lisa Damstrom, Law Clerk
Helmer, Martins & Morgan Co., L.P.A.
                                                                                            13
                                                                                                      Q. And your age?
                                                                                            14
15 Mr. Roger Owensby
                                                                                            15
                                                                                                      A. 36.
16
    Mrs. Brenda Owensby
                                                                                                      Q. Date of birth?
                                                                                             16
17
                                                                                             17
                                                                                                      A. 5/20/67.
 18
                                                                                             18
                                                                                                      Q. What is your height?
 19
                                                                                             19
                                                                                                      A. 5' 7."
                       STIPULATIONS
 20
                                                                                                      Q. And on November 7th of 2000 what was your
                                                                                             20
           It is stipulated by and among counsel for the
 21
                                                                                             21 weight?
     respective parties that the deposition of DAVID
 22
                                                                                                       A. Approximately 175.
                                                                                             22
     WILLIAM MUNTER JR., a witness herein, called by the
                                                                                                       Q. Have you ever had your deposition taken
                                                                                             23
     plaintiffs for cross-examination, pursuant to the
                                                                                             24 before?
```

Page 76

Page 77

Page 74

- A. Well --1
- O. Did you want to say something? 2
- A. It was not -- it was not a set -- like
- 4 a -- like a -- just one building. It was like
- 5 buildings. It was --
- Q. Okay.
- A. You know, it was -- it was like two or
- 8 three like together, but you can go through the
- 9 courtyard and then you can come around, and there's
- 10 like a building here on the right (indicating).
- 11 That's the way Curtis went, Officer Walker. And
- 12 then I was going to cut through.
- O. All right. At some point, then, you 13
- 14 folk-- you and Officer Walker split up and you start
- 15 to go your way and he goes his, right?
- A. Yes. 16
- Q. At that point someone says something to 17
- 18 warn the two individuals; is that right?
- 19
- O. That's the next thing that happens? 20
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And that person, if I'm 22
- 23 understanding you correctly, was Mr. Owensby?
- A. Yes. 24

- Q. Do you know if the individuals started
- 2 running because of what Mr. Owensby said or because
- 3 they saw a uniformed officer?
- A. Beca--

5

- MR. HARDIN: Objection.
- You may answer. 6
- A. Because of what Mr. Owensby said. Because
- 8 when that happened, Officer Walker didn't have
- 9 enough time to get around. So they -- they had --
- 10 they had -- they -- they couldn't have possibly even
- 11 seen him yet.
- O. But as I understand it, Mr. Owensby was
- 13 not one of the four individuals that you and Officer
- 14 Jorg had observed conducting drug activity at the
- 15 phone booth?
- 16 A. That's correct.
- Q. He was just somebody that you happened 17
- 18 upon as you were going around the building?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. At that point, as I understand it, you 20
- 21 walk up to Mr. Owensby and put your left hand on his
- 22 shoulder?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. What shoulder did you put it on? 24

Page 75

- Q. Are you sure of that?
- A. Yes. 2
- Q. What is the best of your recollection of 3
- 4 what Mr. Owensby said?
- A. It was, The boys or Five-oh. 5
- Q. Say that again. 6
- A. It was either, The boys or Five-oh. 7
- O. And in response to what -- could you see
- 9 the two individuals at the time Mr. Owensby said
- 10 this?
- A. They would -- they were just -- as he said 11
- 12 it, they were just leaving out of my view.
- Q. Did you see -- so then you could not see
- 14 what, if anything, they did in response?
- A. Oh. Ran. 15
- O. You did see that? 16
- A. Yes. Uh-huh. 17
- 18 Q. Okay. Do you know if Mr. Owensby said
- 19 that toward them or was saying it to someone else?
- A. He's saying it toward them, because he 20
- 21 turned to them and said it, in their direction.
- Q. Do you know where Officer Walker was at 22
- 23 the time?
- A. No.

- A. On his left shoulder. 1
- Q. Were you facing him face to face or did
- 3 you come up from behind?
- A. Walking to his right, right beside him.
- Q. So you put your left arm -- you're --
- 6 you're to his -- his right and you put your left
- 7 hand on his left shoulder?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And you say "What's up?" And he says,
- 10 "What's up?" And you say, you know, You can't be
- 11 doing that, or something like that, right?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. And he said, What do you -- What do you
- 14 mean or what. And you said, What you just did. Is
- 15 that right?
- A. Yes. 16
- Q. And then you started to reach in your 17
- 18 shirt to pull your badge out, which was hanging on a
- 19 chain around your neck?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you know whether or not you got the 21
- 22 badge all the way out before Mr. Owensby started to
- 23 run?
- 24 A. Yes, I got it out

Owensby, et al.vs. City of Cincinnati November 6, 2003

Daga 96		Page 88
Page 86		
1 letting them know that we were there.	1	A. Yes.
2 Q. How how far was he from you when he	2	Q on that day?
3 said that?	3	A. Yes.
4 A. About, hmm, maybe from here to that wall	4	Q. Do you see that with respect to Jaysen
5 (indicating).	•	Hill he is charged with criminal trespass and an
6 Q. What, ten feet?	6 0	open container?
7 A. Oh, more than that.	7	A. Yes.
8 Q. Morc?	8	Q. Is there any reason why there's no charge
9 A. Maybe	9 o	of trafficking
10 Q. 20 feet?	10	A. Yes.
11 A. Maybe. Maybe 20 feet. I don't know	11	Q or any kind of drug activity?
12 exactly.	12	A. Yes.
Q. All right. When you had walked up to Mr.	13	Q. Why?
14 Owensby, put your arm your left hand on his left	14	A. Because we didn't recover the drugs.
15 shoulder, around him, when you were talking to him,	15	Q. Did you recover any money, any large sums
16 were you looking at him?	16 O	of money on these people out of these drug deals?
17 A. Directly at him, yes.	17	A. I didn't.
18 Q. Did you notice if he had any facial hair?	18	THE REPORTER: I'm sorry?
19 A. If he did, it was like real light. I	19	THE WITNESS: I did not.
20 don't remember having like a full beard or full	20	Q. Do you know whether Officer Jorg did?
21 mustache or anything.	21	A. Not to my knowledge he didn't.
22 Q. Did he have the did he have how was	22	Q. So based on what you found on these
23 his hair? Was it in dreadlocks, was it short-cut?		ndividuals well, let's talk about the second
24 How how was it?	24 C	one. Mr. Nixon is cited with criminal trespass.
Page 87		Page 89
1 A. Like a short afro.	1	Same thing, there were no no drugs and no large
2 Q. At that point, as I understand your	2 \$	sums of money found, correct?
3 testimony, you then return to Officer Jorg, tell him	3	A. That's correct.
4 what happened, right?	4	Q. Based on what you found at the scene when
5 A. Uh-huh. Yes.	5	you got there, there was no evidence of drug
6 Q. And maybe maybe you've already answered	6 6	notivity taking place, was there?
7 this, but do you recall whether or not Officer		activity taking place, was there?
	7	A. Are you talking about after the fact?
8 Walker joined you and Officer Jorg?	1	•
8 Walker joined you and Officer Jorg? 9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there.	7 8	A. Are you talking about after the fact?
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there.	7 8 9	A. Are you talking about after the fact?Q. When when you're based on the arrest
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that	7 8 9	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there.	7 8 9 10 11	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals.
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names?	7 8 9 10 11	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names. 13 Q. Let me show you let me show you what's	7 8 9 10 11 12	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away.
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names.	7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe?
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names. 13 Q. Let me show you let me show you what's 14 previously been marked as Exhibit 6. These are 15 two Exhibit 6 are two arrest and investigation	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe? A. That's what I believe. Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark as Exhibit 6A.
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names. 13 Q. Let me show you let me show you what's 14 previously been marked as Exhibit 6. These are	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe? A. That's what I believe. Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark as
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names. 13 Q. Let me show you let me show you what's 14 previously been marked as Exhibit 6. These are 15 two Exhibit 6 are two arrest and investigation 16 reports. The first one is for a Jaysen Hill and the	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe? A. That's what I believe. Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark as Exhibit 6A.
A. I don't recall if he came back over there. Q. Do you recall who of the two people that were arrested, who was cited, their their names? A. I don't remember their names. Q. Let me show you let me show you what's previously been marked as Exhibit 6. These are two Exhibit 6 are two arrest and investigation reports. The first one is for a Jaysen Hill and the second is for a Jarvis Nixon.	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe? A. That's what I believe. Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark as Exhibit 6A. (Deposition Exhibit 6A was marked for identi-
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names. 13 Q. Let me show you let me show you what's 14 previously been marked as Exhibit 6. These are 15 two Exhibit 6 are two arrest and investigation 16 reports. The first one is for a Jaysen Hill and the 17 second is for a Jarvis Nixon. 18 You see the arrest location is the Sam's	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe? A. That's what I believe. Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark as Exhibit 6A. (Deposition Exhibit 6A was marked for identification.) Q. You see Exhibit 6A is an arrest and
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names. 13 Q. Let me show you let me show you what's 14 previously been marked as Exhibit 6. These are 15 two Exhibit 6 are two arrest and investigation 16 reports. The first one is for a Jaysen Hill and the 17 second is for a Jarvis Nixon. 18 You see the arrest location is the Sam's 19 Carry Out address of 2092 Seymour Avenue and the	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe? A. That's what I believe. Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark as Exhibit 6A. (Deposition Exhibit 6A was marked for identification.) Q. You see Exhibit 6A is an arrest and
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names. 13 Q. Let me show you let me show you what's 14 previously been marked as Exhibit 6. These are 15 two Exhibit 6 are two arrest and investigation 16 reports. The first one is for a Jaysen Hill and the 17 second is for a Jarvis Nixon. 18 You see the arrest location is the Sam's 19 Carry Out address of 2092 Seymour Avenue and the 20 arresting officer is Jorg, with your name also	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe? A. That's what I believe. Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark as Exhibit 6A. (Deposition Exhibit 6A was marked for identification.) Q. You see Exhibit 6A is an arrest and investigation report for one Dominic Peterson, same
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names. 13 Q. Let me show you let me show you what's 14 previously been marked as Exhibit 6. These are 15 two Exhibit 6 are two arrest and investigation 16 reports. The first one is for a Jaysen Hill and the 17 second is for a Jarvis Nixon. 18 You see the arrest location is the Sam's 19 Carry Out address of 2092 Seymour Avenue and the 20 arresting officer is Jorg, with your name also 21 listed. Do you see that?	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe? A. That's what I believe. Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark as Exhibit 6A. (Deposition Exhibit 6A was marked for identification.) Q. You see Exhibit 6A is an arrest and investigation report for one Dominic Peterson, same location, same date, same time. And the person is
9 A. I don't recall if he came back over there. 10 Q. Do you recall who of the two people that 11 were arrested, who was cited, their — their names? 12 A. I don't remember their names. 13 Q. Let me show you — let me show you what's 14 previously been marked as Exhibit 6. These are 15 two — Exhibit 6 are two arrest and investigation 16 reports. The first one is for a Jaysen Hill and the 17 second is for a Jarvis Nixon. 18 You see the arrest location is the Sam's 19 Carry Out address of 2092 Seymour Avenue and the 20 arresting officer is Jorg, with your name also 21 listed. Do you see that? 22 A. Yes.	7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Are you talking about after the fact? Q. When when you're based on the arrest and what you found on the person of these individuals. A. Okay. What we observed to put us there went with the two that got away. Q. Okay. That's what you believe? A. That's what I believe. Q. Let me show you what I'm going to mark as Exhibit 6A. (Deposition Exhibit 6A was marked for identification.) Q. You see Exhibit 6A is an arrest and investigation report for one Dominic Peterson, same location, same date, same time. And the person is searched by Officer Walker, and this person is

Page	94	

- A. No. Jorg marked all of these when he 1 2 filled out the --
- O. Do you recall -- do you --3
- A. -- the arrest slips. 4
- Q. Do you recall any discussion between you
- 6 and Officer Jorg as to who was going to go to court?
- A. No.
- Can I add something to this? 8
- Q O. Sure.
- A. It's not directly related to this
- 11 particular thing, but when this incident happened,
- 12 after the night of November 7th, 2000, Officer Jorg
- 13 and Officer Caton were going around saying, that
- 14 same night, that the -- that Mr. Owensby was wanted
- 15 for assault on a PO and obstructing.
- He ran from me. It was basically my 16
- 17 investigation that day. That night and from there
- 18 on I always said, had this tragedy not happened, the
- 19 only charges I was going to place on him was
- 20 obstruction and jaywalking. And the jaywalking is
- 21 because he -- I chased him through a crosswalk,
- 22 around a car. And obstructing is for warning the --
- 23 the individuals of our presence.
- And that goes back to what I was telling 24

- 1 you about different officers and officer discretion
- 2 and different styles. I wouldn't have placed a
- 3 criminal trespass. If, for whatever reason, I
- 4 didn't get the drugs and the money to make my case,
- 5 even though we set there and we observed them, we
- 6 watched them, if I couldn't make it, you know, I try
- 7 again another day, the next time.
- Same way with Mr. Owensby. He pushed me
- 9 to flee. He didn't strike me or -- I didn't -- I
- 10 wasn't under the impression that he was trying to
- 11 harm -- or cause me harm. Therefore, I would not
- 12 have charged him with felon-- with assault on a PO,
- 13 with assault on a police officer. But they would
- 14 have. That's the difference between this and that.
- 15 That -- I'm trying to show you the --
- 16 Q. Right.
- A. Okay. 17
- Q. Thank you. 18
- 19 A. You're welcome.
- Q. Do you think -- was the push a result of 20
- 21 you having your hand and arm around his shoulder? 21 previously been marked as Exhibit 7. This is a
- MR. HARDIN: Objection. 22
- A. It was when I identified myself as a 23
- 24 police officer. And he pushed me and kept saying,

- Page 96
- 1 "I didn't do anything, I didn't do nothing, I didn't 2 do nothing." That's why I felt like he was just
- 3 trying to basically get away. He -- he wasn't try
- 4 to hurt me.
- Q. When you put your arm around Mr. Owensby,
- 6 he didn't know that you were a police officer,
- 7 right?
- A. No. 8
- Q. Based on your training, was that an
- 10 assault on Mr. Owensby?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Why not?
- A. Because I didn't strike him, I didn't -- I 13
- 14 didn't cause or attempt to cause or knowingly
- attempt to cause him any physical harm.
- Q. And was -- you've already indicated when
- 17 Mr. Owensby tried to push away, he wasn't trying to
- strike you?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. And he wasn't trying to cause you any
- 21 harm?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. When -- when you Maced Mr. Owensby and
- 24 the -- the -- the blowback that you described, did
- Page 95
- 1 you then file some sort of report about deploying
- 2 your Mace?
- A. No.
- Q. I thought that earlier today you had
- 5 indicated that when Mace is used, you have to --
- A. If you actually Mace --
- 7 Q. -- the officer has to --
- A. Yeah, if you actually Mace somebody. I
- 9 didn't get -- I didn't get to Mace him.
- 10 Q. How do you know the Mace didn't get to
- 11 him?
- A. I don't. I don't. I don't know. 12
- 13 Q. Okay.
- A. You're right. You're right. I don't
- 15 know. But I don't think it did, in my opinion.
- Q. What color was the sweat shirt, the -- the
- 17 hooded sweat shirt?
- 18 A. Dark color. Dark blue or black.
- O. In the radio transmission or the 19
- 20 transcript of -- well, let me show you what's
- 22 transcription of the radio traffic on September 27,
- 23 2000. And what I want to direct your attention
- 24 to -- are you -- are you -- first of all, are you

Page 97

AFFIDAVIT

STATE OF OHIO

:

COUNTY OF HAMILTON

SS

I, Wendy L. Welsh, Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, do hereby state that the transcript of the deposition of DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER, JR., deponent herein, having been submitted to said deponent for review and signature, has not been signed within the thirty (30) day period allowed under the Federal Rules; said deposition to now have the same force and effect as though signed.

Wendy L. Welsh, Court Reporter

Sworn to before me this 27 day of January, 2004.

Thomas M. Blasing

Notary Public - State of Ohio

My commission expires: May 4, 2004.

Estate of Roger D. Owensby, Jr. December 4, 2003

DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER, JR. VOLUME II

107

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO

WESTERN DIVISION

ESTATE OF ROGER D.

OWENSBY JR., et al.,

Plaintiffs, : Case No. 01-CV-769

vs. : (Judge S. A. Spiegel)

CITY OF CINCINNATI, : VOLUME II

et al.,

Defendants. :

Continued videotaped deposition of DAVID
WILLIAM HUNTER JR., a witness herein, called by the
plaintiffs for cross-examination, pursuant to the
Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, taken before me,
Wendy Davies Welsh, a Registered Diplomate Reporter
and Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, at
the offices of Helmer, Martins & Morgan Co. LPA,
1900 Fourth & Walnut Centre, 105 East Fourth Street,
Cincinnati, Ohio, on Thursday, December 4, 2003, at

Pages: 107 - 282

10:11 a.m.

Estate of Roger D. Owensby, Jr. December 4, 2003

DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER, JR. VOLUME II

eccmoer 4	, 2003			V ODOME I
1 APPEARANCES:		Page 108	1	Page 1 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, may be taken at
	of the Plaintiffs:	į		this time by the notary; that said deposition may be
	ıl B. Martins, Esq.			reduced to writing in stenotype by the notary, whose
Dor	n Stiens, Esq. Lmer, Martins & Morgan Co. LPA			notes may then be transcribed out of the presence of
Sui	te 1900, Fourth & Walnut Centre	ļ		the witness; and that proof of the official
Cia	ncinnati, Ohio 45202 one: (513) 421-2400			character and qualifications of the notary is
				expressly waived.
The	nn J. Helbling, Esq. 2 Helbling Law Firm, L.L.C.	1	8	INDEX
Cia	72 Springdale Road ncinnati, Ohio 45251		9	
	one: (513) 923-9740			•
Stephen	lf of the Defendants City of Golf Manor, Tilley, Roby Heiland and Chris	i	10	Mr. Martins
1 Campbel		ŀ	11	Mr. Hardin
Re	lson G. Weisenfelder Jr., Esq. ndigs, Fry, Kiely & Dennis		12	
On	0 Fourth & Vine Tower e West Fourth Street	1	13	EXHIBITS
Ph	ncinnati, Ohio 45202-3688 one: (513) 381-9200		14	Page Deposition Exhibit 85
	lf of the Defendants City of Cincinnati,			Deposition Exhibit 86 131 Deposition Exhibit 87 152
6 Darren	Sellers, and Jason Hodge:	:	16	Deposition Exhibit 88 219 Deposition Exhibit 89 221
	ri Hernandez Geiler, Esq. sistant City Solicitor		17	Deposition Exhibit 90 234 Deposition Exhibit 91 236
	partment of Law om 214, City Hall		18	Deposition Exhibit 92 238 Deposition Exhibit 93 244
19 80	1 Plum Street ncinnati, Ohio 45202		19	Deposition Exhibit 94
	one: (513) 352-3346		20	Deposition Exhibit 96
1			21	
22			22	
3			23	
24			24	
		Page 109		Page 11
1 APPEARANCES	(Continued):	, , , , , , , ,	1	DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER JR.
	lf of the Defendants Robert B. Jorg, Caton, Jason Hodge, Victor Spellen and		_	being by me previously duly cautioned and sworn,
	Sellers:			deposes and says as follows:
	nald E. Hardin, Esq.		4	VIDEOGRAPHER: Time is 10:11 a.m. The
5 91	rdin, Lefton, Lazarus & Marks, LLC 5 Cincinnati Club Building		5	date is December the 4th. The year is 2003.
6 C5	Garfield Place Incinnati, Ohio 45202		6	We're on the record, sir.
7	none: (513) 721-7300		7	CONTINUED CROSS-EXAMINATION
8	ulf of David William Hunter Jr.:			BY MR. MARTINS:
9 11	ny Clark, Esq. 14 East 8th Street		8	Q. Officer Hunter, we're picking up where we
10 Ci	nite 400 incinnati, Ohio 45202	,		left off after November 6, your first couple hours
11	none (513) 587-2887		ļ	· •
Also present 12	t:			of your deposition. Remind you that you are still
Richard W. 0 13	Grubb, Videographer		l	under oath. Okay?
	om, Law Clerk tins & Morgan Co., L.P.A.		13	A. Yes, sir.
15 Roger Owens			14	Q. All right. Have you talked with anyone
16 Brenda Owen			i	about your deposition on November 6th between
17 Shawn Owens			i i	November 6th and today?
18			17	A. No, besides my attorney.
19			18	
20	STIPULATIONS		19	
	stipulated by and among counsel for the		20	•
	parties that the deposition of DAVID		21	
-	TER JR., a witness herein, called by the		22	
בי שודירידעש עמט	ithe one, a miches hereith carred by the		123	November 7, 2000. I understand in the sometime
24 plaintiffs	for cross-examination, pursuant to the		i i	on that day you received an MTD message request for

Estate of Roger D. Owensby, Jr.

17 together?

18

19

20

22

23

Q. Yeah.

A. (Witness complies.)

A. Because -- okay. And put a number 2?

24 entrance to stop and talk to Mr. Owensby, do you

DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER, JR. VOLUME II

December 4, 2003 Page 140 Page 142 1 know whether or not he was carrying a nightstick? 1 said, "You can" -- he said -- he -- he said, "I 2 don't have anything on me," and he lifted his shirt. A. I don't recall. 3 And then he said, "You can pat me down." He said, 3 O. A PR-24? 4 "I'm not -- I haven't done anything. I'm not 4 A. I don't recall if he was carrying one or 5 wanted. You can -- you can pat me down after you 5 not. 6 run me through." Q. Do you know whether or not that night 6 Q. When you told Officer Jorg and Officer 7 Officer Jorg was carrying a collapsible PR-24 or a 8 Hunter that, "That's him," you were standing at the regular full-size PR-24? A. I don't remember what type he had. window -- excuse me -- did they say anything in 10 response? 10 Q. What happens next? 11 A. You said Officer --11 A. Officer Jorg and Officer Caton talk to Mr. MR. CLARK: You mean Caton? 12 12 Owensby. They asked him questions. And then, like 13 I said, I -- I stood back, because I was still under 13 A. Caton. It should have been Caton. You 14 said Officer Jorg and Officer Hunter. 14 the contact-cover concept. If they both were going Q. I'm sorry. I'm sorry. Officer -- when 15 15 to jump in and talk, then I just stood back as 16 cover. Because in actuality only one person should 16 you told Officer Jorg and Officer Caton that, "That's him," when you were standing at the window, 17 have been talking. The other two should have been 18 did they say anything in response? standing back. 19 A. I don't remember if they said anything. 19 So once they were done doing their --20 Q. You folks walk around to the front and 20 their thing, they -- the -- the last thing one of 21 either Jorg or Caton start talking to Mr. Owensby 21 them asked, I believe it was Officer Jorg, was, 22 at -- at the -- the entrance; is that right? "Well, have you ever fought the police?" 23 23 Q. Fought? Q. Where are you at this point? 24 A. Fought. Fought the police. And then Mr. 24 Page 141 Page 143 A. Standing just behind them. 1 1 Owensby said no. Then, after that, that's when I O. Be--2 2 walked up. Well, you know, I -- not really walked A. Off to the left side. 3 3 up, I was there, but that's when I came in the Q. To the left of Jorg and Caton? 4 4 doorway just, you know, where I could make eye A. Just behind them, to the -- just slightly 5 contact with Mr. Owensby. And I -- and I asked him, 6 to the left. I was -- they were right in the 6 I said, "So, have you ever ran from the police?" 7 doorway, both of them, because -- that's -- the And then when he saw that, it was a 8 reason why I can't remember who was talking, because 8 reaction on his face and then that's when he broke 9 at some point they both were talking, and so I don't 9 for the door. 10 know who says what first. 10 THE REPORTER: I'm sorry, "broke for 11 Q. Okay. On Exhibit 86 there, would you draw 11 the" --12 a circle indicating where Jorg, Caton and Owensby 12 THE WITNESS: The door. 13 were and put the number 2 in it. 13 A. Ran toward -- I mean, he was in the 14 A. Just a circle where they were? 14 doorway. And then it's like he tried to run past 15 Q. Where they were located. 15 us. 16 A. Okay. All together? Just a circle all Q. When he broke to ran -- to run, did -- did 16

Q. Yes, sir. And then a number 3 with a 20 completely past Officer Jorg and Caton before they 21 circle, indicating where you were. 21 grabbed him? A. I think he did. It happened so fast, but Q. When Officer Jorg walked over to that

A. No.

18

19

23 I -- I think he actually just got -- because he went

Q. As he went past you, did -- did he get

24 by so fast. And then it was like, next thing you

17 he push you or assault you in any way?

DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER, JR. VOLUME II

December 4, 2003	VOLUME II
Page 208	Page 210
1 A. Yes.	Did you see on the night of November 7,
2 Q. I want to show you what's previously been	2 2000, Mr. Owensby assault any police officer?
3 marked as Exhibit 21. This is a transcription of	3 A. No.
4 the audio on the tape that you've just seen, the	4 Q. He certainly didn't assault you?
5 videotape that you've just seen. I want to ask you	5 A. No.
6 some questions. And if you want to hear, in	6 Q. In fact, he never touched you as he went
7 addition to what's there, I'll be happy to	7 by.
8 A. Okay.	8 A. No.
9 Q go through the tape, but what I want to	9 Q. Is that correct?
10 direct you to is on the third page. It says that	10 A. Yes.
11 at the top of the page, you say "Stopped for	11 Q. And the resisting would be well, what
12 investigation of obstruction." And that's what	12 do you take the resisting to mean? Or did you think
13 we just talked about today, right?	13 he was resisting?
	1
14 A. Okay.	_
15 Q. Is that right?	15 Q. And how was he resisting? 16 A. By not allowing himself to be arrested.
16 A. Yes.	, ,
17 Q. Okay. And "I had on him, remember the	17 So he was resisting arrest. He was in a defensive
18 hooded sweatshirt guy? Was working that day, sarge.	18 posture, but he was ordered to give his hands and
19 The guy that ripped out uh."	19 his wrist and allow us to handcuff him, and he did
Now, who are you talking to when you're	20 not. He didn't comply with our orders.
21 saying "Stopped for investigation of	Q. Now now, while Officer Jorg is saying
22 obstruction"?	22 all of this to Sergeant Browner, you're standing
A. I was talking to Sergeant Browner, I	23 there, right?
24 believe.	24 A. Yes.
Page 209	Page 211
1 Q. And when you said "Stopped for	1 Q. Is there a reason
2 investigation of obstruction," are you referring	2 A. I think I'm standing there.
3 to the incident on September 27th?	3 Q. I'm sorry?
4 A. Yes.	4 A. I said I think I'm still standing there.
5 Q. Then if we go further downer down	5 Q. Okay.
6 there, Sergeant Browner says, "What's he wanted	6 A. I don't know if I walked away or not.
7 for?"	7 Q. Is there well, you see at the end of
8 And Officer Jorg says, "He's wanted for	8 Officer Jorg's talking
9 trafficking resisting and assault on a police	9 A. Yeah, down here. Okay.
10 officer from a prior."	10 Q you start talking again?
We've already established that he was not	11 A. Yeah. I'm still there.
12 wanted for trafficking, right?	12 Q. So
13 A. Right.	13 A. That's what I was trying to get down to,
Q. And he was not wanted for assault on a	14 that part. Yeah.
15 police officer?	Q. Okay. Is there a reason why you did not
16 A. Right.	16 correct Officer Jorg as to the prior, where he told
Q. And was he wanted for resisting or just	17 Sergeant Browner that Mr. Owensby was wanted for a
18 obstruction?	18 prior trafficking and assault on a police officer?
19 A. Obstructing.	19 A. No, no reason other than when he was
20 Q. So he wasn't wanted for resisting either?	20 telling her whatever he was telling her, I wasn't
21 And then it says, "But we didn't know his	21 really paying complete attention of what the charges
22 name at the time. Now we got him ID, he's wanted	22 were that he was saying that he was saying,
23 again for assault on a police officer" and	23 because I already had it in my mind, I already knew
24 "resisting."	24 in my mind what the charges should have been. So I
6.	D 200 Dags 211

Estate of Roger D. Owensby, Jr. December 4, 2003

DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER, JR.

Page 212

1 wasn't really tuned in to hear what he was saying.

- 2 I knew what the charges should have been.
- Q. And in your mind, the prior charges should 4 have been obstructing --
- A. And --
- Q. -- and jaywalking? 6
- 7 A. Right.
- 8 Q. And when he said -- when Officer Jorg then
- 9 says "he's wanted again for assault on a police
- 10 officer to resisting," again, is there a reason why
- 11 you didn't say something to the effect of he's not
- 12 wanted for assault on a police officer?
- 13 A. Where's that at?
- 14 Q. Third line in what -- in Jorg's -- see
- 15 Jorg says, "He's wanted for trafficking
- 16 resisting" --
- 17 A. Trafficking, resisting.
- Q. -- "assault on a police officer from a 18
- prior." And we just talked about that. 19
- 20 A. Okay.
- 21 Q. He says, "But we didn't know his name at
- 22 the time."
- A. Uh-huh. 23
- Q. "Now we got him ID, he's wanted again for 24

VOLUME II

Page 214

- 1 "that's when I said oh, so when was the last time
- 2 you ran from the police." And "That's when we" --
 - And then Sergeant Watts breaks in and
- 4 says, "Did anyone strike him or spray?" And then he
- 5 says, "Just sprayed him."
- 6 And Jorg says, "I don't know who sprayed
- 7 him. I had his head wrapped almost the whole time."
- Is there a reason why, at that point when
- 9 Sergeant Watts asked about if anybody struck him,
- 10 struck Mr. Owensby, why --
- 11 A. Uh-huh.
- 12 Q. -- you didn't say yeah, somebody struck
- 13 him?
- 14 A. Yeah, there was a reason.
- 15 Q. What was the reason?
- A. The reason is I wasn't going to talk out 16
- 17 against two other officers in front of them at that
- 18 particular time. I was going to take Officer -- I
- 19 mean Sergeant Watts off to the side and tell him
- what happened.
- 21 Q. Did you ever get that opportunity?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. On the -- the last page Officer Jorg says,
- 24 he had -- "I had my hand across his forchead, trying

Page 213

1 assault on a police officer to resisting."

- 2 A. Uh-huh.
- Q. And my question is, is there a reason why
- 4 you did not correct Officer Jorg as to assault?
- A. On that -- that new charge?
- Q. As to the -- the charge for that night of 7 assault on a police officer.
- A. Okay. Because I didn't know if he, you
- 9 know, felt like -- I didn't know if I missed
- 10 something where he -- they -- him or Caton got
- 11 assaulted.
- 12 There was nothing that I saw that I would
- 13 say that yeah, you know, this person -- if they made
- 14 a claim or if they said they got assaulted and I was
- 15 called to court to testify, there was nothing I
- 16 could say to substantiate that they had been
- 17 assaulted.
- 18 So to me, no, he that -- not-- nobody got
- 19 assaulted. But if they claimed an assault, I -- I
- 20 can't say that they didn't get assaulted as far as
- 21 like if that was their claim that night. But in
- 22 testifying, I can say no, I didn't see them get
- 23 assaulted.
- 24 Q. At the bottom of the page you -- you say,

1 to hold him down to the ground. I ... had one of

- 2 his arms as a restraint move. I didn't throw
- 3 anything. And then uh, he dropped his head. As I
- 4 was" turning "to hold him down, he brought his head
- 5 up. I had to push it back down and he hit his head
- 6 on the ground. It wasn't intentional move. I
- 7 didn't go to hit his head on the ground. Sarge, I'm
- 8 gonna, well I'm" --
- Did you see what Officer Jorg is
- 10 describing here as pushing his head down on the
- 11 ground?
- 12 A. I didn't see that.
- 13 O. You did not?
- 14 A. No.
- Q. On -- going back to page 3, Officer Jorg's 15
- 16 statement, after he says in the third line, "wanted
- 17 again for assault on a police officer to resisting,"
- 18 and then he says, "We uh, well we're" over -- "over
- 19 there doing investigation waiting for these guys,"
- 20 do you know who he's talking about as far as
- 21 "waiting for these guys"?
- 22 A. That night?
- Q. Yeah. I guess this is -- this is the 23
- 24 night of November 7.

Page 215

AFFIDAVIT

STATE OF OHIO

COUNTY OF HAMILTON

SS

I, Wendy L. Welsh, Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, do hereby state that the transcript of the deposition of DAVID WILLIAM HUNTER, JR., deponent herein, having been submitted to said deponent for review and signature, has not been signed within the thirty (30) day period allowed under the Federal Rules; said deposition to now have the same force and effect as though signed.

Sworn to before me this 27 day of Jacobs, 2004.

Thomas M. Blasing

Notary Public - State of Ohio

My commission expires: May 4, 2004.